

# **Ten-year Review**

## **Buffalo City**

**Seán Morrow**

**Kim Engel**

**Human Sciences Research Council**

**June 2003**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1. INTRODUCTION: THE NATURE OF THE PROJECT</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>2. AREA DESCRIPTION</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>2.1 Overview of recent history</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>2.2 Population Profile</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>3. GOVERNMENTAL INTERVENTIONS: A SURVEY</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>3.1 Homeland Industrial Development</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>3.2 Fish River Spatial Development Initiative/ East London Industrial Development Zone</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>3.3 Duncan Village Project</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>3.4 Mdantsane Urban Renewal Project</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>3.5 Local Economic Developments and Tourism</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>3.6 The impact of large development and social improvement projects</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>4. DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING OBJECTIVES</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>4.1 IDP Summary</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>4.2 Revitalisation Plan</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>4.3 Financing of development</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>5. DELIVERY SECTORS: THE RECORD</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>5.1 Obstacles and problems</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>5.2 Development actors</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>5.3 Interviews and survey</b>	<b>31</b>

<b>5.4</b>	<b>Delivery focus Sectors</b>	<b>31</b>	
	<b>5.4.1</b>	<b>ELECTRICITY</b>	<b>32</b>
	<b>5.4.2</b>	<b>SANITATION</b>	<b>33</b>
	<b>5.4.3</b>	<b>WATER</b>	<b>34</b>
	<b>5.4.4</b>	<b>HOUSING</b>	<b>36</b>
	<b>5.4.5</b>	<b>HEALTH</b>	<b>38</b>
	<b>5.4.6</b>	<b>COMMUNITY SAFETY</b>	<b>40</b>
	<b>5.4.7</b>	<b>TELECOMMUNICATIONS</b>	<b>42</b>
	<b>5.4.8</b>	<b>EDUCATION</b>	<b>42</b>
	<b>5.4.9</b>	<b>WASTE MANAGEMENT</b>	<b>46</b>
<b>5.5</b>	<b>Impact: an assessment</b>	<b>48</b>	
<b>6.</b>	<b>SUMMARY AND CONCLUDING REMARKS</b>	<b>53</b>	
	<b>DOCUMENTS CONSULTED</b>	<b>57</b>	
	<b>INTERVIEWEES/ INTERVIEWERS DURING FIELDWORK</b>	<b>58</b>	

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report, based on interviews and a variety of primary and secondary literature, is on the impact of services provided by different spheres of government in the Buffalo City municipality.

Buffalo City, formed in 2000, is a combination of what were originally “white” East London and King William’s Town, with parts of the ex-Ciskei including Mdantsane, Dimbaza and Bisho, and other areas. Buffalo City municipality is deeply influenced by its proximity to what were the impoverished rural homelands of Ciskei and Transkei, and immigration from these areas inevitably puts strain on the municipal facilities as people move in escaping rural poverty and hoping for a better life in the city. This poses many welfare and development challenges.

The report emphasises the various large-scale interventions of a social and developmental nature that have taken place over the years. Even before the democratic election of 1994, homeland industrialisation took place on a substantial scale at Dimbaza and smaller centres like Fort Jackson, areas that are now part of Buffalo City. These initiatives were based on protectionism and subsidies and were intended to demonstrate the supposed viability of the homelands, in this case Ciskei. With the end of the homeland era and withdrawal of support, most of these artificially-flourishing developments collapsed, with consequent loss of jobs.

Economic development projects post-1994 were in a fundamentally changed context. Not only had the homeland system disappeared, but world conditions dictated that South Africa adapt its industrial development strategies in line with a world economy where an inward-looking policy of protectionism and import substitution would condemn any nation to stagnation. In South Africa, one of the vehicles for this new approach was that of the Spatial Development Initiatives (SDIs), one of which was the Fish River SDI, at one end of which stood East London, now part of Buffalo City. Progress after the 1997 launch, and therefore impact, was slow at first, but the concept crystallised into the East London Industrial Development Zone (ELIDZ) on the one hand, and the Coega Harbour project, near Port Elizabeth, on the other. The ELIDZ Corporation facilitates domestic and foreign investment, and eases the way of industrialists in what it is believed is a natural and competitive environment for certain types of industrial development. The fact that the zone is in close proximity to the port and airport, and that it should have many synergies with the Daimler-Chrysler vehicle factory, East London’s biggest industry, symbolises the emphasis on

competitiveness and openness to the outside world. However, work on supporting infrastructure for the ELIDZ is at an early stage.

Parallel with these major initiatives, supported by all levels of government, is a more modest initiative for which a department has been founded at municipal level that seeks to encourage local economic development amongst SMMEs. However, it is equally a product of its time and environment and has in common with the ELIDZ that it is based not on artificially subsidising job-creation but rather the encouragement of entrepreneurship and the facilitation only of business that can be expected to exist independently and profitably. Again, it is at an early stage.

Especially given recent South African history and the source of the government's strength and support, there is clearly a need for visible improvement in the conditions of the poorest. In the Buffalo City context, two initiatives are the Duncan Village project and the more recent Mdantsane Urban Renewal Project. Both are calculated to improve conditions of life in these poor areas of the city, while providing economic opportunities for the inhabitants, though the developmental side of these projects is not always very clearly articulated. Unfortunately, the Duncan Village project became mired in disagreements and rivalries and appears to have lost its way: impact, therefore, was disappointing, and even, to some extent, negative. The Mdantsane Urban Renewal Project is in its early stages. With this project as with several already mentioned, it is as yet too soon to judge their impact.

The report emphasises that day-to-day service delivery, especially by the municipality but also by a range of other provincial and national government departments, is the level at which most people experience the impact of government for most of the time. This is also essential background to understanding the environment in which the major developmental initiatives outlined above take place. The report therefore outlines the development and planning objectives of the municipality as expressed in the Integrated Development Plan, and proceeds to report on progress and difficulties in various sectors such as electricity, sanitation, water, housing and so on.

While there is differing progress in different spheres, a common thread is that of the administrative, financial and technical difficulties emanating from the need for the resources and equipment of relatively well-endowed East London, and to an extent the smaller centre of King William's Town, to be stretched to service the whole of Buffalo City, many of whose constituent parts were grossly neglected in terms of services, equipment, infrastructure and qualified personnel when they were part of Ciskei. This has many effects, amongst them a decline in the ability to keep careful records

without which it is difficult to plan properly, and a tendency to operate more than is healthy in hand-to-mouth, crisis management mode. When this is taken in conjunction with the fact of a mostly ageing corps of technical professionals, and the difficulties of recruiting replacements, there is a crisis of capacity that, unless there is a significant change, is likely to intensify.

The very useful Buffalo City *Quality of Life Survey*, as well as the limited enquiry carried out in Mdantsane by the present researchers, are utilised to estimate the availability of services to the public, their satisfaction with these services, and their aspirations for additional services. The overall impression is of a community that is on average very poor and has many needs, but which is perhaps somewhat less racked by criminality than many South African urban communities. The community is broken down by housing type, which is probably a reasonably accurate guide to social class, and of course in South African conditions intersects with race categories. There are few surprises here: the needs and wants of most people are for decent housing, clean water, clinics, an adequate sewage system, well-maintained and safe roads, accessible telecommunications, and the like. The poorest are particularly anxious to have better health services, better roads and street lighting.

In terms of the impact of services that have already been provided, amongst the poorest, where they have it available to them, there is a high level of satisfaction with electricity. Again, where they are available, the poor are particularly happy to have access to public telephones, and to safe, reliable and cheap public transport, such as a train service.

The report concludes by noting the probably inevitable tension in special governmental interventions between the need for long-term sustainable economic development, and the need to respond to the imperative to alleviate poverty and poor living conditions. "Impact" becomes difficult to assess when the criteria inevitably tend to shift according to the measure used.

It also notes the difficulties of increasing equity while adequately maintaining the physical and organisational structures of the urban core of Buffalo City. This, as noted above, is a difficult balance to achieve, yet even in terms of the overall economic development of the area it is a crucial one since it is necessary that the city be maintained as a pleasing place to live for all workers, including those whose skills make them essential for the hoped-for industrial development, and whose consequent mobility make their place of residence a matter of choice rather than inevitability.

## **BUFFALO CITY**

### **TEN-YEAR REVIEW**

#### **1. INTRODUCTION: THE NATURE OF THE PROJECT**

As the poorest province, with a long history of radical politics and the place of origin of many leaders of the liberation movement, the Eastern Cape is a touchstone for the success or otherwise of the post-1994 government in improving the life of the people and creating an environment that enables development capable of ensuring the continuation of such improvement. Successive administrative reorganisations have faced the area with serious challenges. The scale of this report does not allow for a comprehensive review of an area as large and complex and, administratively speaking, fluid, as Buffalo City. It should therefore be emphasised that the interviews and research for this report were primarily conducted within the framework of the city of East London with Mdantsane, and this was the remit that the researchers were originally given for the research. However, the perspective that the researchers were requested to adopt altered during the course of the project, and indeed some themes, and especially that of the major socio-economic development projects that have characterised the area over the years, make it necessary to take the whole contemporary municipality, and even to some extent areas beyond, into account. The report must be seen, therefore, as a series of snapshots with different fields of vision, and different levels of focus.

The report will emphasise some of the larger special projects that have been embarked upon in the municipality. These, however, should be seen against the background of the more mundane but essential service delivery areas that impact daily on the life of citizens, and that provide the context of special developmental initiatives. Thus, the report first outlines the history without which the impact of initiatives over the past ten years cannot be understood; examines some important developmental and social welfare initiatives over the same period of time; gives a picture of what one crucial actor, the municipality, sees as its aims by looking at the IDP; looks at the record of delivery in various sectors, and at the impact that this is perceived to have by the citizens of Buffalo City; and, finally, tries to draw some overall conclusions.

## **2. AREA DESCRIPTION**

Buffalo City is a municipality, the second-biggest in area of all South African municipalities, with a population of approximately 1.4 million. It came into existence following the local government elections in 2000 and includes, *inter alia*, East London, King William's Town, Dimbaza and both ex-homeland and "white" farming areas. It is the metropolis for the poor eastern region of the Eastern Cape, itself the poorest province in South Africa. It contains prosperous suburbs, once all-white, now increasingly racially varied; large black townships; rural areas that were once part of the impoverished Ciskei homeland, and others that are occupied by large farms; large flourishing industrial enterprises, the most important being the Daimler-Chrysler motor factory, and ex-homeland industrial centres, now languishing, that once existed on the basis of subsidies and protectionism. It has an excellent airport, recently renovated and expanded, with flights to all major South African centres and cargo facilities; good, though lengthy, road-connections to other metropolitan areas, and it is a commercial port. This port, which has good turn-around times and spare capacity, and is capable of taking ocean-going ships, is not however capable of taking the largest tankers and ore-carriers. Given the nature of the environment, neither will this ever be a possibility. A large part of the port traffic, and the economic well being of the city, depends particularly on the motor industry. Buffalo City has a large, poor, rural hinterland, including, immediately adjacent, the ex-homeland of Ciskei, and, more distantly, Transkei, and the corridor of predominantly white-owned farms, and small towns, that stretches north to Queenstown and beyond.

### **2.1 Overview of recent history**

East London was founded in 1847, and its early history as the port of "British Kaffraria" is embedded in the lengthy colonial conquest of the Eastern Cape. With the discovery of diamonds and then gold in the interior of what is now South Africa, East London became one of the ports serving the mining areas, first by ox-wagon and subsequently by the railway that was commenced in 1873. The railway bypassed King William's Town, which thus increasingly lost its position to East London as the premier urban settlement of the region. This was also the year when the breakwater that made East London a reliable port was commenced. The city's growth was boosted by the activity that surrounded the South African War at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.



The growth of the city was accompanied by, and depended upon, African immigration from surrounding areas. In the earlier twentieth century, divisions between “red” and “school” that originated in part in the mission educational system of the rural Eastern Cape reproduced themselves in the city, and were reflected in, on the one hand, African elite politics, represented for instance by Walter Rubusana, and on the other in the sometimes violent protests of the urban poor, who lived in some of the worst conditions to be found in any of the cities of the country.

In the 1950s, coinciding with the shift from trading centre to industrial node of some importance, and with the imposition of apartheid policies, there was a heightening of political and social tension in the city. East London was one of the most militant ANC and ANC Youth League centres, prominent, for instance, in the Defiance Campaign, though the relationship between politics of this kind and the elemental energies welling up from the urban poor had tensions of its own. This was illustrated in the riots of 1952, which resulted in anarchic violence dismaying to the black political leadership of the time.

In terms of the social structure of East London, a major government initiative of the 1960s was the creation of Mdantsane, what became a very large township later incorporated in the Ciskei homeland. This followed the early “model” township of Zwelitsha, near King William’s Town, founded in the 1940s as a reservoir for labour in the textile industry. While Mdantsane was intended both to take “surplus” population from the Western Cape and from the city of East London itself, in fact the population of black areas of the city such as Duncan Village did not noticeably decrease. With the banning of the ANC and PAC, East London, including Mdantsane, remained centres of what now became of necessity underground political militancy. East London also became an important centre of the Black Consciousness movement in the 1970s: Steve Biko was from Ginsberg, a location of neighbouring King William’s Town. During the 1980s East London remained a centre of militant political activity, being a UDF stronghold. The Mdantsane bus boycott of 1983 is one of the most prominent of the many episodes in the resistance history of the area.

With the lifting of the ban on proscribed political organizations, and the elections of 1994, the commitment of the majority of the people of the city to the ANC, reflected in the national, provincial, and, later, local elections, was evident. Mdantsane was merged with East London, and in

the local elections of 2000, when the much larger entity of Buffalo City, of which East London is a part, was created, once again the ANC achieved a substantial majority. In terms of the area which the political and administrative leadership now had to manage, a fundamental fact is that the relatively well-resourced “white” city of East London merged first with the large and under-resourced Ciskei township of Mdantsane, and then with King William’s Town, the major township of Zwelitsha, Chalumna and other rural areas, the depressed homeland industrial centre of Dimbaza and a variety of other places. Given the realities of the under-resourcing of black areas under the previous regime, the old East London infrastructure, with some help from that of King William’s Town, has to stretch to cover the whole area of current Buffalo City. There is, therefore, a basic problem of maintaining and expanding provision with inadequate resources.

An aspect that cuts across the picture above in complex ways is that of the relationship of Buffalo City to the provincial administration of the Eastern Cape. Though, as is apparent from the currently-proceeding commission of investigation, there are many criticisms of how the province is run, the provincial administration is a palpable presence: its capital, Bisho, which was also the old Ciskei capital, lies within the boundaries of Buffalo City. This has been in some respects to the detriment of other centres: Port Elizabeth, for example, has lost the provincial headquarters of the South African Police Service to Zwelitsha/King William’s Town, and Umtata, which does not even have the industrial and commercial resources of Port Elizabeth, has suffered considerably from the loss of its position as capital of the Transkei homeland. Buffalo City, on the other hand, has benefited through the presence and spending power of the government and administration, though whether also by an unwarranted attention to the development and welfare needs of the area as compared to other parts of the Eastern Cape is a moot point. It would appear that much of this spending-power has actually been utilized in East London, with, for example, property prices there rising more sharply than in King William’s Town and Bisho itself.

A point that should be emphasized in attempting to understand Buffalo City and its development challenges, is that the city is the apex of a desperately poor and heavily populated rural region. The problems that flow from this fact all over urban and periurban South Africa are magnified in the case of this area. However successful development initiatives may be, and however many jobs are created, there are likely to be ever more immigrants from rural areas clamouring for attention. The apartheid regime corralled this poverty into the homelands: in today’s more humane society this is neither possible nor desirable. The result, though, is that rural poverty will continue to wash up

against urban areas. Where poverty is particularly harsh, as in the eastern part of the Eastern Cape, the impact will be correspondingly great.

## 2.2 Population profile

The figures in this section are based on the analysis of Richards and Kamman (Richards and Kamman: 2001). In the IDP, other, higher, estimates are also given (IDP: 35-36). Based on the 1996 census, which however underestimated the inhabitants of Duncan Village, one of the major African centres in the city, the population of the old East London Transitional Local Council, and the new Buffalo City Municipality, by population group, was as follows:

	Total	African/black	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	Unspecified
Number (BC)	681,548	563,323	38,269	4,661	70,467	4,828
Per cent (BC)	100	82.7	5.6	0.7	10.3	0.7
Number (ELTRC)	409,329	308,473	32,881	3,868	61,950	2,157
Per cent (ELTRC)	100	75.4	8.0	0.9	15.1	0.5

There were slightly more women than men in the municipality. 68% of the population was 35 years or younger. Though criteria for measurement are not always clear or comparable, Richards and Kamman estimate that in BC as a whole, over 45.5% of Africans can be deemed poor, as compared to 4.5% of coloureds and 0.2% of whites. It would appear that though female-headed households are poorer than those headed by males, the difference is not as great as, for instance, in the Durban area. Income is highly unequally divided between the poor and the better-off of BC: the wealthiest 10.5% of the population in decile 10 of EAs captures over 41.6% of total income.

The following picture emerges of employment:

	BC per cent	ELTRC per cent
Employed	57.6	45.4
Unemployed, looking for work	36.5	46.8
Not working, not looking for work	5.9	7.8
Total %	100	100

More women than men are unemployed, and in BC as a whole, 28% of those working are in unskilled occupations.

Levels of educational attainment were low in BC, with 73.9% of the population not having completed education to matric level, and with 3.9% of the population possessing some form of tertiary qualification. Again, educational level was highly skewed in terms of population group, though not in gender terms.

Education level	BC per cent	ELTRC per cent
No schooling	15.2	12.5
Some primary	20.8	18.3
Completed primary (to grade 7)	8.2	7.8
Some secondary	29.7	32.5
Matric only	10.2	12.0
Tertiary (certificate and diplomas)	2.8	3.4
Tertiary (university degrees)	1.1	1.4
Other	12.0	12.1
Total	100	100

A series of other indicators analysed by Richards and Kamman – housing, toilet facilities, water supply, fuel supply, refuse removal, and telephone facilities – follow similar patterns, and will be specified under the relevant headings later in this report.

### **3. GOVERNMENTAL INTERVENTIONS: A SURVEY**

Dealing with a historical legacy such as this confronts government with many administrative and developmental challenges. Initiatives taken within the framework of apartheid, which as well as being based on the concept of racial separation were also protectionist in economic terms, have been dismantled because of the radically changed political situation and because of significant changes in the global economic environment. In Buffalo City as elsewhere, this has posed difficult questions as to how to deal with the basic needs of impoverished communities while at the same time embarking on what will hopefully be longer-term solutions that generate resources rather than simply consuming them.

Nonetheless, from the governmental point of view the objective of economic development is to create a better life for citizens. While it is true that spending on social projects does not in itself necessarily generate resources, the welfare of the people cannot be simply ignored until some future time when wealth-generation takes off decisively. Therefore, projects to improve the environment and quality of life of the inhabitants have also been embarked upon. While these create jobs in construction and maintenance, and hopefully kick-start the local economy, this tends not to be their primary concern, or at least their primary effect. A number of projects of a directly developmental nature outside the normal processes of service delivery, and a number that have social welfare at their core, are discussed below.

#### **3:1 Homeland Industrial Development**

Current development efforts in Buffalo City should be seen against the background of a series of initiatives. Under apartheid, there were a number of initiatives that impacted on the area that is now Buffalo City. In the 1960s there was a strategy to develop border industries in the so-called white corridor between the Ciskei and Transkei reserves. East London was one of the designated growth points, extending to the nearby town of Berlin, and there was some industrial expansion, based however on the subsidies and rebates of the South African government. By the mid 1970s the local economy was again stagnant.

With internal self-government for the Ciskei in 1972, the emphasis shifted to development within the reserve itself. Though under late apartheid there was the pretence that the homelands were

separate and sovereign states, in fact they were appendages of the South Africa of the time. In no area was this clearer than in the vicinity of East London, which relied on the labour of the inhabitants of neighbouring Mdantsane, part of Ciskei. Nominally autonomous Ciskei, using resources provided by South Africa, embarked on a policy of highly subsidized, low-wage, industrial development, with investment being attracted from South Africa and from other parts of the world to nodes like Dimbaza and Fort Jackson, and the already substantial Zwelitsha, all now within Buffalo City. The Ciskei National Development Corporation (CNDP) was created to stimulate economic growth, but between 1974 and 1981 development projects of all kinds had created a total of 8,096 jobs, half of them in the Good Hope Textile Mill in Zwelitsha.

Dimbaza was considered a showpiece at the time. This settlement originated as a dumping-ground for people relocated under the forced removals policy. It was chosen for this industrial experiment partly to counteract the poor image of this policy which drew international attention to Dimbaza. Soon after the initiation of the industrial programme in 1974, the town began to attract voluntary immigration, with the population increasing from about 4,000 – 5,000 in 1969 to 18,000 by 1980.

Dimbaza sums up the problems of homeland industrial development. The cost per industrial job in 1980 ranged from R2,667 for wood products to R29,455 for fabricated metal products, which was the fastest-growing manufacturing sector. The problem of creating large numbers of jobs was therefore not overcome, and those who were employed were mostly women, who were cheapest and least likely to protest. Industry at Dimbaza was unable to absorb the large number of job-seekers, and unemployment in the town was estimated as from 30% to 35% of the working population in the late 1970s.

With the changes of the late 1980s and early '90s, and particularly with the abolition of the homelands in 1994, the protectionism and subsidies that had cocooned Dimbaza disappeared, revealing the fragility of a policy based on subsidies. The relative isolation of Dimbaza, which had been of less significance when counteracted by subsidies and tax holidays, became obvious. Most industry disappeared rapidly, finding little difficulty in relocating from what were often little more than warehouse-like assembly plants, and Dimbaza, from being a centre of a relatively large amount of employment, became a centre of high unemployment, as it remains to this day. While a few industries with a higher level of investment, like Dimbaza Foundry, still survive, and while some light industry has moved back to Dimbaza, utilizing the existing plant and large pool of labour, it seems unlikely that this apartheid creation will ever flourish again. Industrial development in

Buffalo City has moved closer to the coast, and this is the trajectory that is receiving official support. Whether, in retrospect, it might have been wiser to reduce subsidies more gradually and attempt to retain at least some of the jobs that had been created in the homelands is a difficult point. This did not happen, and subsidies were rapidly terminated, with the effects outlined.

### **3:2 Fish River Spatial Development Initiative/East London Industrial Development Zone**

As has been seen, before 1990 South Africa tended to have high tariffs on imports and various other barriers that encouraged import substitution and self-sufficiency. Already towards the end of the 1980s this policy was beginning to shift, and the new democratic government moved towards a radically different policy that emphasized “supply-side” measures aimed at encouraging investment and increasing competitiveness rather than “demand-side” support (tariffs and quotas). One important aspect of this was the Spatial Development Initiatives (SDIs), which aimed to overcome the racially and spatially fragmented development pattern that characterized the past. The underlying concept is that public investment should be concentrated in locations that need long-term sustainable growth and employment opportunities, but that also have sufficient potential in terms of infrastructure, potential markets and other matters to deliver results, leading, hopefully, to a “crowding in” of investment. Though there may be a place for Public Private Partnerships, the role of government is not to invest directly in development, but rather to be a facilitator, creating an environment to which industry will find it attractive to locate.

Buffalo City is at the north-eastern end of the Fish River SDI, the other end being the Port Elizabeth-Uitenhage complex, now the Nelson Mandela Metropole. The Fish River SDI was launched late in 1997, together with a package of incentives, such as tax holidays of up to nine years, three years accelerated depreciation, relocation allowances and a loan finance scheme supported by the Industrial Development Corporation. At the time, the takeup on these benefits was minimal.

The relationship between East London and Port Elizabeth has always been one of rivalry, and if anything this was initially even emphasized by the linking of these centres in this initiative. However, over time spheres of operation were demarcated and crystallized into the Coega Deep Water Harbour, near Port Elizabeth, and the East London Development Zone Corporation

(ELDZC), supported by the Department of Trade and Industry, which was established as a Section 21 Company in 1999 and formally designated in April 2002. There have been various foci at Coega, including that on a large *entrepôt* at the base of Africa, and the establishment of a large smelter as anchor tenant, together with other heavy industry; the East London Industrial Development Zone (ELIDZ), on the other hand, emphasises lighter high-value industry, and the processing of the agricultural products of the region. The Fish River SDI, of which the ELIDZ is one part, therefore has two poles that appear to constitute a potentially satisfactory division of labour.

It is premature to make judgements about the effectiveness of the ELIDZ, which, if successful, could play a major role in the development of the city and the region. It should benefit the community, by generating jobs, and by broadening the revenue base of the city: if all goes well, it is estimated that by year 10 of the project about 11% of total municipal rates will derive from the ELIDZ.

Clearly there will be short-term benefits from construction, which began on a large scale with the award of an R80 million construction tender in May 2003. Crucial, however, are the plans for industrial development, dependent on private sector investment, much of it from overseas. Some of this will be in a “free port” area, where materials can be imported and exported free of South African duties; some will be in an adjoining industrial area outside the duty free area where industries will be able to utilise a comprehensive range of “one-stop-shop” services provided by the ELIDZ Corporation.

The IDZ will also impact in a major way on the consumption and supply of services. This also sets up certain strains, which have to be negotiated. It is clear that unless services to industry such as electricity, water, waste-disposal and transport are of a consistently high quality and level of reliability, investment will not take place. Industrial development is also in the interests of the municipal population as a whole. Nevertheless, in the short and medium term the allocation of resources to the IDZ may slow the pace of service installation and maintenance in the poorer areas and lead to tension between the IDZ and the Municipality which is in turn under political and social pressure to deliver. So far, though there are criticisms on both sides, a balance seems to have been achieved. The IDZ is also itself a partner in such development, and is providing, for example, two electricity sub-stations, major assistance with roads, and the like.



The strategy represented by the development of Dimbaza, Fort Jackson and, in the neighbouring Transkei, Butterworth, contrasts interestingly with that of the Fish River SDI and the ELIDZ. The emphasis of the National Party-supported homeland industrial strategy was on cheap labour and import-substitution; the industrial areas were inland. The SDI/ELIDZ strategy stresses export markets and the global economy; the centre of gravity is on the coast. Though in circumstances that were politically unacceptable, and that in any case it would be impossible to replicate in the early twenty-first century, the homeland industrial policy did create a number of mainly unskilled, low-level jobs. There has now been a basic change in approach, from a protectionist model to one based on an open economy where the state is seen as a facilitator of development, with market forces the true driving force. It remains to be seen if the new, far more open, model will, as well as contributing to a competitive industrial base, also create the many jobs that Buffalo City and the Eastern Cape as a whole badly need.

### **3:3 Duncan Village Project**

Duncan Village, a black low income township that survived embedded within East London throughout the apartheid period, is a densely populated area with very poor infrastructure. The area has a population of approximately 80 000 people, and 50% of the East London's population is crammed onto just 2% of its land, in 2001 reaching an estimated 3000 people per hectare. Housing conditions are atrocious, with formal housing facilities only available to a small portion of the area's population.

The idea of the presidential project in Duncan Village was to create an integrated society, granting the local community easier access to, for example, employment, housing, education, health and the like. The aim was to erase the isolation of this community and to encourage both economic and social development. This was to be achieved by physical planning, and a strategic plan was developed which included the results of research on aspects of topography, infrastructure and housing. Projects in Duncan Village were of a social developmental nature, but also with underlying attempts to develop the local economy by drawing on and encouraging local business and skills. However, the project was not primarily economic in orientation and there was no directly economic development plan as part of this project.

Implementation of the project as a whole was on an *ad hoc* basis and there were some early signs that it might not result in the intended outcomes. An example here is the first phase of the project, with the introduction of electricity to 5000 informal dwellings. The motivation for this was the high numbers of shack fires in the area. But because residents found the use of electricity too costly, and with approximately 90% of the population still using paraffin after the introduction of electricity, the threat of fires was still as great a concern as ever.

The project as a whole has seemingly not had the intended impact. Dissatisfied with many services, the South African National Civic Association in Duncan Village has this year been calling for information concerning the Duncan Village Presidential Project, fire and flood disasters, the development fund and the deterioration of services. There are no doubt political rivalries at work here, but it is also true that these have something to work on in the problems that have beset this project.

So even though the attempts to uplift this community have been made, impact has been negligible and indeed the vision of the creation of an integrated well-balanced society remains elusive.

### **3:4 Mdantsane Urban Renewal Project**

Mdantsane was founded by the apartheid government as a black residential township, which in effect it still is. Incorporated under the homeland government of Ciskei, infrastructure provision was and remains very poor. Following the transition to democratic governance in 1994, the former East London TLC administration developed and implemented a number of plans and initiatives with the aim of developing an integrated urban renewal programme. Plans developed in the later 1990s include the:

- Mdantsane Town Centre (Highway) Development Framework Plan (1996)
- Mdantsane/ Potsdam Development Plan (1997-1998)
- Mdantsane – East London Development (MELD) Corridor Planning Report (1998-1999)

The two latter plans have, with the identification of key nodes, provided the framework for integrated development in Mdantsane.

The inadequacies of physical infrastructure in Mdantsane, especially with respect to roads, water, sewerage, electricity, housing, and social infrastructure generally, has seen most developments in the area concentrate on these needs.

In 2001, the government announced plans, which the Department of Provincial and Local Government is responsible for coordinating and implementing, for an Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Programme and an Urban Renewal Strategy. The latter is relevant in this context.

These strategies are formed in such a way as to identify certain key nodal points, and focus development in these areas so as to ensure that there would be sufficient concentration in particular areas to make an impact; these, once developed, can then serve as points from which further development can flow.

Mdantsane was selected as one of the eight areas under the Urban Renewal Strategy. Following this, Buffalo City municipality made a submission in October 2001 to seek funding, outlining priority projects identified in the Mdantsane area. It noted the backlogs and development challenges that still need to be overcome, in spite of previous development initiatives. It focused particularly on four broad areas. Firstly economic, looking at the mix of land uses, the intention being to allocate areas for economic activities such as industry and agriculture. Secondly infrastructure, which is the largest of the four areas and includes plans for water, sewerage and transport networks. Thirdly, social infrastructure, which includes plans for education, healthcare and welfare. The last area is housing development.

It can be seen that while the primary emphasis of this project is social and environmental, it is also realised that these purposes will be best served if they can be linked to sustainable economic development. The implementation of these development initiatives under the Urban Renewal Strategy is meant to have local economic spin-offs through the direct or indirect creation of jobs. The project targets the local population for labour for all the projects, focussing specifically on women, the youth and the disabled. It also emphasises the use of local business and materials suppliers. However, although these may be created for the length of the development period, employment created through the development projects cannot be expected to create sustainable employment over the long term. The diversification of land uses and the economic development that it is hoped will result in the Mdantsane do indeed plan to address this, but it is still too early to predict to what extent these elements of the plan, once implemented, would succeed. It may turn

out that it is the short-term activity stemming from the project itself that will be the main spin-off in terms of economic involvement.

Buffalo City municipality, which is the main implementing agency, envisages that all three tiers of government will contribute to the urban renewal process of Mdantsane. In the 2002/03 financial year it was granted R29 million from central funds for this purpose. Also in that year it set aside R13 million in municipal funds for projects and plans identified for urban renewal in Mdantsane.

Urban Renewal as a government strategy is just under way, and it will clearly take some time to implement. Only hereafter can its impacts be properly assessed.

### **3:5 Local Economic Development and Tourism**

Buffalo City Municipality has recently formed a unit to assist in developing the local economy, and particularly small, medium and micro enterprises (SMMEs). Since this fulfils a different sort of function to other departments, and emphasizes development rather than service delivery in a more limited sense, this initiative will be discussed here, in the context of other programmes of a developmental nature.

#### **3:5:1 Background**

Unemployment is a key problem that confronts people in the East London area, with approximately one third of the adult population being unemployed. Further, development of business activity is slow. This lack of opportunity renders people unable to provide basic needs for themselves and their families and households.

Conscious of the unemployment problem, the framers of the IDP identified areas of economic concern within the local economy. These include a high degree of dependency on one or two economic sectors, crime and the perceived lack of safety and security, lack of profitability experienced by business, the lack of skilled human resources and inadequate infrastructure.

In trying to overcome some of these challenges, and in an attempt to aid people to both find and create business opportunities, the IDP gave priority to the setting up of a local economic

development unit. This unit was to pay special attention to a rural economic development strategy, an agricultural development strategy for both rural and urban areas and tourism. In the context of economic development, this unit, in conjunction with other larger projects in the area such as the ELIDZ, is intended to serve the economic development function.

### **3:5:2 Current Situation**

This municipal department got under way in July 2002 with an aim and purpose somewhat different to what has previously been the case with such projects. Rather than focusing on the social aspects of development, this unit is directly geared towards economic development. This includes both the development of an economic framework in which the local community can operate, as well as the direct development of people's entrepreneurial skills.

Within the four established sub-directorates of business development, rural and urban agriculture, tourism development and promotion, and trade and investments, the unit has within a short space of time and with limited budgetary funding, been able to undertake projects and initiatives in partnership with key role players in society such as Daimler Chrysler. The establishment of these partnerships has proved invaluable to both the funding and implementation of specific initiatives.

It does however have its own set of challenges. These include the limited extent of budgetary funding, leading to reliance on donor funding, and lack of administrative support as well as difficulties in delivery as a result of the lack of basic infrastructure. The latter requires the success of other municipal functions, particularly those involved in the delivery of services and the development of infrastructure. Successful economic development thus relies thus not only on the success of this unit (and other projects directly geared towards economic development), but on the coordinated efforts of local government as a whole towards the building of a sustainable integrated social and economic programme. It can be seen that though on a completely different scale and level of funding to, for example, the ELIDZ, this project does have in common with it a concentration on economic reality and a refusal to artificially prop up non-viable initiatives.

### **3:6 The impact of large development and social improvement projects**

It is difficult to assess the impact of projects such as those discussed above. Though it would have been or would be claimed that all had the welfare of the people of the area at their centre, they started and start with different preconceptions and cannot easily be compared. Nevertheless, some broad statements about impact can be made.

- Homeland industrial development, of which, in this area, the encouragement of industry at Dimbaza was the most prominent example, was based on an ideology of racial and ethnic separation which required that, on some level, the homeland policy had to work or seem to work. It was based on subsidies and protectionism, and did indeed create a considerable number of generally poorly-paid jobs. With the withdrawal of supports, such industry largely collapsed and most of these jobs were lost. In terms of impact it can be said that while jobs were created, they were not sustainable – or at least were not sustained - either politically or in terms of the changing economic climate of the 1990s.
- The Fish River SDI and its offshoot, ELIDZ, were and are based on a different philosophy. This consists of encouraging what are considered the natural industrial growth points in the Eastern Cape, and facilitating the path of industrialists who, it is hoped, will choose to base themselves in the province because of the intrinsic locational, labour, environmental and other advantages that it offers. It would seem that for a considerable time this particular example of the SDI concept had little impact. Only in recent times, when ELIDZ so to speak crystallised out of the SDI idea (and, in the Port Elizabeth area, the Coega harbour project), and with the beginning of actual physical development in the vicinity of East London harbour, is the idea really going to be put to the test. It is, therefore, too soon to speak of impact on any large scale by ELIDZ on the life of the people of the area. Tentative indications are that it may have a beneficial impact that goes beyond the jobs created during construction of the infrastructure. However, for good reason the promoters are reluctant to publicise industrial commitments that have not been finally secured. So far, most development, and therefore creation or maintenance of jobs, has happened in relation to Daimler Chrysler and other firms independently of such projects – though not independently of the support of the municipality and other governmental actors.

- The Duncan Village Project, part of the focus on urban development represented by the Urban Development Framework of 1997, and the parallel Special Integrated Presidential Projects for Urban Renewal (SIPPS), was based on a different motivation, that of social development, particularly in housing, of a long neglected area, rather than that of encouraging a supposedly rational capitalism to do its hopefully beneficial work. It was however hoped that the scheme would also give an impetus to economic development in the area. Schemes like this were intended, at a time of change and uncertainty in local government, to provide models for integrated and sustainable development as outlined in the RDP. However, this, and the next scheme discussed, make an interesting contrast with the approach of the SDI/ELIDZ, and represent the inevitable tension that lies at the centre of the government's wish on the one hand to harness powerful local and international economic forces in the interests of solidly-grounded development, which it is envisaged will lead to more general prosperity, and on the other to more immediately serve the interests of the very poorest, who may be unwilling to wait for such long-term benefits, and would in all likelihood be the last to benefit from them in any case.

Unfortunately, this scheme appears to have been implemented in a clumsy manner and it became involved in complex and continuing political conflict in the area, with accusations of cronyism and failure to consult. Though some improvements did occur because of the project, it would have to be said that it largely disintegrated in a welter of accusation and counteraccusation, and with a general feeling of disillusion in the locality. Impact, therefore, has been disappointing, and even to some extent counter-productive.

- It is too soon to judge the impact of the Mdantsane Urban Renewal Scheme, which is part of the Urban Renewal Programme announced in early 2001. Some money has been allocated, but as yet no projects have been announced, so no judgement can be made in this respect. While there is as yet no overall policy document outlining the aims of the initiative, the intended approach, which is participative and aims to empower local people, can be deduced from various statements, and from the practice of the most advanced of these initiatives, notably the Alexandra Renewal Project (see parallel report on Alexandra). How this works out in practice in Mdantsane has still to be seen.
- Though it is not in any way in competition with the other projects outlined above, the initiative at municipal level to encourage local economic development and tourism makes an interesting contrast with them. This initiative is not highly funded, and indeed at the time of

writing still relies to a considerable extent on support from the donor and private sector. It is centred on a unit focussing on the problems and needs of small business in Buffalo City. It does this on the basis of business principles, and leaves other problems such as social welfare and housing to those equipped to deal with them. It could be said, therefore, that it is attempting to abandon a welfare-oriented approach to small business, and to encourage sound commercial practice in this sphere that will hopefully ensure viability and growth. Again, though there are encouraging signs, it is too soon to judge on the impact of this initiative, which commenced in 2002.



## **4. DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING OBJECTIVES**

This and the following chapter represent a shift in focus from the initiatives described in the previous section to the more mundane business of municipal administration and day-to-day service delivery. The two levels are connected however, in that the provision of a decent, predictable and stable environment at all levels of society is crucial to any plans for economic development, and in that the municipality has a crucial role to play in provision of services, like water, electricity and waste disposal that are essential to such development.

It is therefore important to know what the vision of the Buffalo City Municipality is for the future. This is expressed in the Integrated Development Plan (IDP), which is summarized below. It is applicable to the broader Buffalo City Municipality and not only to East London and surrounding areas. This is a substantial and systematic document.

### **4:1 IDP Summary**

- *Electricity*

1. Implementation of an electricity maintenance plan and upgrading of existing infrastructure (ad-hoc and planned maintenance).
2. Upgrading of infrastructure: electricity reticulation and substation upgrading in specific areas within Buffalo City.
3. Replacement of obsolescent electricity prepayment meters.
4. Overhead power mains reconstruction and development.
5. Construction of electricity infrastructure: substations, feeder cables, street lighting, electricity bulk supply substations, switch houses, residential expansion and festive lighting.

- *Water*

1. Implement routine and preventative maintenance programmes throughout the city.

2. New equipment for effective water loss management.
3. Provision of basic water service to informal and rural settlements, identification of nodes and extensions to existing schemes in informal and rural areas.
4. Dam rehabilitation project.
5. Investigation of groundwater as a source for remote rural areas.
6. Construction of water infrastructure: new storage dam(s) and associated bulk conveyance infrastructure for BC; new reservoirs in areas like Mdantsane; pump stations and rising mains for new housing developments.

- *Sanitation*

1. Routine and preventative maintenance programmes throughout the city.
2. Replacement of Mdantsane Zone 7, 8 and 14 sewers.
3. Refurbishment, upgrading and/or building sewage treatment facilities to service VIP effluent.
4. Take-over, refurbish and upgrade capacity of the DWAF Sewage Treatment Works.
5. Refurbishment of sewers where defective; replace those beyond repair.
6. Refurbish and upgrade existing sewage treatment works to meet compliance standards when treating existing flows as well as flow from new development.
7. Relining of Mdantsane Sewer Pipebridges.
8. Reduce storm water ingress through repairs.
9. Replacement of aged domestic water meters.
10. Provision of new equipment: e.g. tools and equipment for sewerage maintenance.
11. Provision of basic sanitation service (RDP standards) to informal and rural settlements in identified development nodes and corridors and extensions to existing schemes to informal and rural settlements not in defined development nodes.
12. Construction of sewerage infrastructure: e.g. pump stations, sewer connections for new developments, sewage treatment works.

- *Health*

1. Maintenance of existing health services as well as provision of new clinics.
2. Provision of health care support services (X-ray, Pharmacy, Laboratories, etc.).
3. Provision of adequate Primary Health Care focusing on HIV/AIDS.
4. Services by environmental health: vector control, day care inspection/advisory service, noise control, ensuring safe and healthy work environments.
5. Projects: HIV/AIDS high transmission areas project (peer educators).
6. Pilot projects: TB/HIV project and prevention of mother to child transmission of HIV.

- *Housing*

1. Acquisition of land for housing.
2. Ongoing maintenance and upgrading of municipal houses.
3. Housing developments:
  1. East London: 22 projects with approximately 27 900 houses.
  2. King Williams Town: 10 projects with approximately 7 500 houses.
  3. Rural Housing: 12 projects with approximately 11 600 houses.

- *Community safety*

1. New police stations in Mdantsane, King William's Town, Beacon Bay, Chalumna.
2. New fire stations in Gonubie, Berlin, Newlands, Bisho, Kaysers/Kidds Beach, Chalumna and KWT.
3. Ongoing maintenance and upgrading of Dimbaza, Greenfields and Fleet Street fire stations.
4. Maintenance of traffic signals.
5. New equipment for safety and security.

6. Traffic safety pilot projects.

- *Roads*

1. Upgrading of infrastructure: Qumza Highway, Gonubie Main Road, Vincent Park roads.
2. Rehabilitation of infrastructure: Rural Road Rehabilitation, Sidewalk Rehabilitation, Secondary Roads Upgrade, Tarred Road Rehabilitation and Bridge Rehabilitation.
3. Construction of various traffic infrastructure.

- *Commercial development projects*

1. Business improvement district projects.
2. Community Bases Tourism Project: Arts and Craft Market (KWT – Bisho Corridor).
3. Tourism anchor project on the Marina Glen site.
4. Central beachfront revitalisation programme.
5. Pirie fish hatchery and hiking trails and trout fishing.
6. Multi-purpose Sports Centre on the Showground site, Amalinda.
7. Implementation of economic components: KWT-Bisho Development Corridor Plan, Sleeper Site and Signal Hill project, MELD Corridor Nodes.
8. Implementation of agricultural and economic components: Needs Camp Zone plan project and Yellowwoods/Kei Road plan.

#### **4:2 Revitalisation Plan**

Even though the IDP has set out developmental aims and objectives, taken no further it will remain a wish list of what is desired, rather than a launching-pad for actual achievement. For practical purposes, Buffalo City has, in order to draw down much needed funds for development, set out a 'Revitalisation Plan', outlining projects and initiatives that further the ideals of the IDP.

The Revitalisation Plan is driven by seven core programme areas, each of which follow a similar systematic approach. These are as follows: 1. Efficiency 2. Customer Care 3. Service Improvement 4. Financial Management 5. Improving Health 6. A Sustainable City 7. Growth and Incomes.

The approach in each of these programmes flows as follows: 1. new approaches to services → 2. expanding the resource base → 3. operating more effectively → 4. working with partners. It is the aim of the Revitalisation Plan to draw resources from national government so as to implement initiatives for local development.

### **4:3 Financing of development**

Basic service needs for all citizens of the Buffalo City Municipality, inclusive of East London and Mdantsane, have not yet been met. The provision of, e.g., water, electricity and sanitation is in many cases sorely lacking. It is often not just a matter of provision, but rather the more acute problem of capacity and lack of bulk infrastructure that needs to be addressed. For this, substantial investment is needed in the area. The Revitalisation Plan for the Municipality aims to attract R150 million of the R315 million made available by the national Department of Finance in the coming financial year as a 'Restructuring Grant'. An interim application to National Treasury for the restructuring grant was made in January 2002. Subsequently, R8 million has been approved for the purpose of the development of a comprehensive restructuring plan.

Coherent development planning is crucial. The implementation of the three-year medium term expenditure framework assists in the planning and flow of projects and funds. It has the effect of eliminating ad hoc projects and encourages a process of development that is continuous and flowing, and that builds on what has already been achieved.

The disbursement of funds is according to specific budget approved projects. Each department submits a budget, which must be indicative not only of budgetary necessities and the funding process, but also of the political will and direction of the particular area. In a sense, keeping track of funds according to project funding records is a relatively straightforward task, but the actual delivery of projects and the monitoring of funds in relation thereto is not so simple. These tasks - monitoring and delivery - are the individual municipal departments' responsibilities.

Municipal budgets leave very limited room for maintenance costs and additional capital expenditure. Sourcing additional funds from already impoverished communities is not possible. This is why together with the improvement of service facilities, it is crucial that the government (referring here mainly to the local municipality) takes action also in the field of community and personal development to help people to become self sufficient and self reliant, with the ability and the opportunity to earn their own income, so that they not only make a contribution towards services, but also add to the income of the region.

## **5. DELIVERY SECTORS: THE RECORD**

### **5:1 Obstacles and problems**

There are many obstacles and barriers to effective service delivery.

The two year old Buffalo City Municipality, is at last at the final stage of staff placements and departmental restructuring after a period of municipal and district amalgamation. Constant changes in municipal structures and in the areas served by these structures tends to result in planning problems.

Planning and capacity problems appear to feature prominently. Because of the lack of adequate planning, and the inability of municipal salaries to attract suitably qualified personnel, coherent planning for the city becomes very problematic. As a result of such constraints, there is also neglect of the keeping of careful records in favour of day to day delivery. Such neglect will, in the long term, impact on the ability to plan intelligently and economically.

Shortage of funds is another problem and brings with it its own set of complications. Because there are limited resources available for services, the most pressing problems are most often addressed. The operating budget for services leaves little room for much needed additional capital investment, and for the maintenance of existing infrastructure. The inability to prioritise maintenance reduces the lifespan of whatever service equipment and infrastructure is already available. Political pressures for new capital investments, as opposed to maintenance, could also undermine departmental decisions on how the few resources available to them are to be used.

### **5:2 Development actors**

The local municipality plays the largest role in service delivery and the development process of the East London area. Each department, with the exception of those that still fall under the provincial authority, is responsible for delivery and development of their particular service sector. The newly created Local Economic Development department plays the lead role in development at the

municipal level. Partnerships in the relevant areas have been established between municipal structures, NGOs and private business.

Service partnerships are more common with NGOs, e.g. in the housing sector, while private business partnerships appear more often within the context of development. Accounts of the relevant partnerships are given in each of the service sectors.

Partnership with private business, although found (see particular service areas for details), is not an overly common experience. Parallel to the creation of the Industrial Development Zone, the Industrial Development Corporation (IDC) is aiding in the funding of potential business in the area. Needless to say, further investment by business would aid the development of the area and expand the municipality's financial base.

### **5:3 Interviews and survey**

In gathering information on the East London area, people from different delivery and development spheres were consulted. These included municipal officials, managers of NGOs, academics in the East London area, development and planning consultants and people from the IDZ and IDC. Although consultation was with a wide cross section of people, the majority of inputs received were directly from municipal officials, at manager or general manager level.

Structured citizen interviews were done with 12 citizens, drawn from different areas in Mdantsane, a formal township just outside East London, representing a cross section of people. However, particular emphasis was placed on, and thus a greater number of interviews were done amongst, those in the lower income groups.

### **5:4 Delivery Focus Sectors**

In this section, in the case of each service delivery area, the background will be briefly outlined, followed by a description of the current situation and an outline of public attitudes.



## **5:4:1 ELECTRICITY**

### **5:4:1:1 Background**

The IDP notes the age and poor condition of the electricity network. “The objective”, it continues, “is to improve the situation through the upgrading of the existing system thereby facilitating universal access to electricity. Equitable and viable tariff policies have to be established and institutional arrangements carried out to facilitate effective and efficient delivery”.

### **5:4:1:2 Current Situation**

- The municipality supplies electricity, and sets rates.
- In Buffalo City as a whole, just over 75% of homes have access to electricity. Of these, 78% use prepaid cards. While all of those with electricity use it for lighting, only 53% of all households use it for cooking. Almost all formal housing at whatever socio-economic level is equipped with electricity.
- Buffalo City has an aging electrical infrastructure. Cabling and other material needs to be renewed at a faster rate than currently. The parlous situation was illustrated by a massive outage on 6 February 2003, which can mainly be blamed on the state of the infrastructure.
- The infrastructure in Mdantsane, the legacy of the Ciskei regime, is particularly poor. Since 1997, however, there has been an ongoing policy of upgrading.
- There is a large number of prepaid customers amongst the lower income groups, and the levels of bypassing and tampering with meters is much lower than in most urban areas.
- Theft of equipment and vandalism is however a problem. The outage of 6 February may have been contributed to by the theft of earthing cable.

- As with many areas, there is a shortage of technically qualified personnel. The electricity department has, for instance, no real expertise in the field of optical fibres.
- The department is doing what it can to facilitate the industrial development of the area. For example, the municipality is spending R22 million in upgrading supply to Daimler-Chrysler.

#### **5:4:1:3 Public Attitudes**

- For those with few services, 20% said that electricity was the service they would like to have, as compared to 40% who said better toilets and 25% upgraded water.

### **5:4:2 SANITATION**

#### **5:4:2:1 Background**

The IDP states that “water and sewerage infrastructure is at capacity and in a poor condition”.

#### **5:4:2:2 Current Situation**

- In large part because of the extreme pressure on water supply, the city is at its limits in terms of water-borne sewage capacity.
- Sewerage treatment facilities are run down.
- Unless there is substantial investment, and the cash and personnel to maintain facilities, water-borne sewage cannot be extended much further. It will be necessary to utilise various forms of on-site sewage disposal methods.

- There are big differences between toilet facilities in different types of housing. Nearly all formal housing has water-borne sewage. Most informal homes in low-income areas however use pit latrines or sometimes the veld.
- While Mdantsane has been developed with domestic water-borne sewage facilities, it is at the moment no longer possible to connect new houses to such facilities because of pressure on the system.
- A major development is the planned marine sewage outfall from the West Bank area. While a high capital cost, it will be cheap to maintain, and will enable industrial and housing development on the West Bank, and in the area between East London and Mdantsane. It appears that this facility would have no significant detrimental environmental impact.

#### **5:4:2:3 Public Attitudes**

- The Quality of Life study found that when people were asked what would be their priority for a service that they do not already have, almost 40% answered that they would like better toilets. This was a considerably bigger proportion than those who answered water or electricity.
- This study also found that there is a greater correlation between good toilet facilities and general satisfaction with life than with any other single facility.

#### **5:4:3 WATER**

##### **5:4:3:1 Background**

As seen under Sanitation, the IDP states that “water and sewerage infrastructure is at capacity and in a poor condition”. This is a barrier to social and economic development. The strategy is to formulate, adopt and implement a Water Services Development Plan, which should aim at “a capacitated and efficient water services delivery institution within 5 years”.

### **5:4:3:2 Current Situation**

Water provision and consumption, and, linked to this, water-borne sanitation, is indeed at full stretch. To remedy this, the city needs to embark on expensive capital works, and/or address the problem of water-losses in Mdantsane. There are various issues in terms of supply and cost:

- Buffalo City controls some but not all water-sources itself. It costs 45% of its operating budget to buy in the 27% of its water that it gets from the Amatola Water Board/DWAF.
- There are problems of waste, linked in part to the standpipe system which may encourage waste, and non-payment, especially in Mdantsane, which consumes about 40% of “coastal” supply.
- There is a lack of coordination between the various role-players, such as DWAF, NGOs (which operate more in the rural areas of the city), the provincial PWD, and the Amatola District Council. This situation should be improved with the institution of a Water Services Authority in July 2003.
- Problems appear to relate more to a shortage of skilled human resources and cash rather than infrastructure, except in the rural areas in the south-west of the municipality.
- Financial and operational data appear to be unreliable.
- Service debt is an intractable problem, and will remain so whatever service provider option is selected.

### **5:4:3:3 Public Attitudes**

- The Quality of Life study found that water is the service that the largest percentage of people in Buffalo City, and particularly of the poorest people, would like to see upgraded. This was the first choice for nearly 30% of people in informal low-service areas.

- Stakeholder meetings organised in the course of the Mdantsane Water Services Feasibility Study in 2001 recognised that the reorganisation of water services in Mdantsane was necessary. There appears, therefore, to be the basis for a combined effort to tackle problems in this sphere. However, access to water was a major frustration, as was debt.

#### **5:4:4 HOUSING**

##### **5:4:4:1 Background**

The IDP recognises that although adequate housing is a basic human right, many in the Buffalo City area lack this. It also recognises that there is a problem of insufficient land for housing development. This needs to be urgently addressed. Government, foreign and private funding is said to be available, although the details as well as the sufficiency of the funding is not addressed within the framework of the IDP.

##### **5:4:4:2 Current Situation**

- Because of low, and often total absence of income, many find it extremely difficult to finance their own homes. For low-income households, loan finance is not an option as they are seen to be ‘too risky’ for the market. There are limited opportunities for loan funding available through a national housing finance scheme. Housing funds are sourced mainly from national government (which accounts for about 90% of funds), and then also from the municipality, through donor funding and also from the beneficiary community. East London housing associations, based on rental and revolving funds, are quite prominent and show encouraging results. These tend to serve working and lower-middle class income groups.
- Problems are experienced as a result of the divergence in national and provincial housing legislation. The local MEC increased the size of the top structure to 40m<sup>2</sup>, keeping the subsidy at the same level, in effect meaning that there would be a squeeze on the cost of material supplies, and ultimately on the quality of the house. To sidestep the issue of quality as laid down by the National Home Builders Registration Council, houses are now

registered under the People's Housing Process, which does not require registration with the NHBRC, because it is the people themselves who do the building, and the people who carry the risk.

- The issue of bulk infrastructure is also a crucial one that needs to be addressed. Without the necessary infrastructure, further housing developments cannot take place. With certain service sectors, e.g. water and sanitation, already running at close to capacity level, new infrastructure will need to be developed to accommodate new housing.
- Although many housing projects have already been completed, large backlogs remain. Housing projects in Buffalo City and specifically within the East London area, are in progress. For many of these, the Municipality acts as the developer. Some ongoing housing projects include the Chris Hani Village in Mdantsane, a people's housing project of 302 houses to be completed by June 2003, the Amalinda Cooperative Settlement Project which consists of 196 serviced sites with houses, with an expected completion date of February 2004, the Amalinda Forest Sinebhonga Village with 200 semi-detached four room units specifically targeted at single mothers with dependants taken from the Municipal Housing waiting list. Many more projects around the East London area and within Buffalo City are in progress.

#### **5:4:4:3 Public Attitudes**

The Quality of Life survey indicates different types of housing, ranging from a house on a separate stand to a traditional dwelling, a flat in a block, a townhouse or cluster home, a retirement unit, a house or flat in a backyard, an informal dwelling, an informal dwelling in a backyard or a room or flat in a main dwelling.

- 61% of people who live in houses on their own stands were generally satisfied or very satisfied with their homes.
- About 60% of people in cluster homes and townhouses and 55% of people in houses, flats and rooms in backyards were satisfied or very satisfied with their homes.

- Of those in informal dwellings not in backyards, not surprisingly, the level of satisfaction was found to be 9%.
- 82% of the population of Buffalo City is African. Only 12% of this group own a fully paid off house and another 12% are busy paying a bond. 24% have informal housing and do not pay rent, while 28% live under tribal tenure. This paints a bleak picture of housing in the municipality, especially for Africans. Although housing development continues, progress is taking some time.

Of the twelve citizens interviewed during fieldwork, 3 were satisfied with the general housing situation; 4 said it was not so satisfactory; the remainder found it to be very unsatisfactory. 4 of the 12 said that their current accommodation was satisfactory for them and their households. When asked about whether they were aware of any government housing delivery programmes in their neighbourhoods, only 2 of the 12 respondents answered yes. It was also these two who felt that the overall housing situation in their neighbourhood had improved. One person felt that it had become worse while the rest (9) felt that there was no change.

## **5:4:5 HEALTH**

### **5:4:5:1 Background**

Health services can be divided into community health care and environmental health. Health services falls within all three spheres of government, namely, national, provincial and local. In addition, Buffalo City faces the challenge of drawing on the Eastern Cape Health Department, the city itself and the Amatole District Authority to provide similar services.

Primary health care is provided through clinics and mobile services. The municipality experiences a critical shortage of staff with the nurse : patient ratio at approximately 1:60 per day; the World Health Organisation benchmark requirement is 1:25 per day. In Buffalo City there is a total of 44 fixed clinics, 13 mobile clinics, an AIDS Training and Information Centre, a community health centre and a day hospital, most of which run five days a week.

### **5:4:5:2 Current Situation**

- While health services in the East London town area are serviced by Buffalo City, those in Mdantsane are serviced by the province. Hospitals are administered by the province.
- Access to clinics varies by housing area. The Quality of Life Survey found that of those living in informal, low service housing areas, 60% had access to clinics. This number dropped to 52% for those living in formal, medium service housing areas, while 84% of those in formal homes with high service levels and high incomes had access to clinics.
- As stated in the IDP, staff shortage is a big problem. In addition, there is also a high staff turnover rate with those leaving being replaced by temporary staff. As well as their daily work, clinic staff also have to make time to teach nursing students who need practical experience. This places extra pressure on already understaffed institutions. Doctors do sessional work at clinics and are available only once a week for a short period. During this time they concentrate mainly on antenatal and TB patients. Emergencies are dealt with by hospitals.
- Clinics are subjected to burglary and vandalism. This interrupts service delivery.
- Environmental health is divided into six programmes, namely, i) food safety, ii) day care, iii) pest control services, iv) vendor control services, v) health complaints and vi) air and noise pollution. Just as with health services, the East London area is serviced by Buffalo City while Mdantsane is serviced by the provincial government. The different capacities, policies, budgets and bylaws of the different service providers have resulted in unequal service levels across various communities.

### **5:4:5:3 Public attitudes**

- The Quality of Life Survey found that 25% of Buffalo City residents thought that access to health services was most important to them. For residents of informal areas, health services,



together with roads and police stations, are the top priority for upgrading. 60% of those in informal, low service areas had access to a clinic, with 52% and 84% in formal medium service and formal high service areas respectively.

- Of the twelve citizens interviewed, only two found the general state of health care in their community good. The responses of the rest ranged from not good (5) to very bad (3) while 2 stated that there were no facilities in their communities. Only half had a clinic in their neighbourhood, although if there were no clinic, there was a doctor's surgery. Some had both. Most respondents, in varying degrees, found it difficult to see a doctor. While 2 found it not difficult, 3 had never seen a doctor in the clinic before and were not sure if doctors visited that particular clinic. Only 2 respondents had been visited by health care workers, in both cases giving advice on AIDS prevention and treatment. When asked about whether it is easier or harder than previously for people to access health care when they need it, 3 said it was easier, 4 responded by saying it was harder while the other 6 said that there was no change (2 gave other responses).

#### **5:4:6 COMMUNITY SAFETY**

##### **5:4:6:1 Background**

The perception of many BC citizens, particularly those in townships and informal settlement areas, is that there is a lack of safety and security. Formal policing does not fall within the sphere of local government, and hence there needs to be a good relationship between national and local government in order to advance safety and security. There is however a City Police corps, that falls within the ambit of local government and which the municipality is looking to expand on the model of the Metro Police elsewhere to ensure the safety of communities. The municipality looks further to build cooperative relationships also with the Community Policing Forums. It is also looking at the expansion of fire-fighting and disaster management to broader areas. This however will require large investment.

### 5:4:6:2 Current Situation

The municipal department of public safety oversees four areas, i) city police, ii) fire and rescue, iii) traffic services and iv) disaster management. With the formation of Buffalo City, funds and resources now have to be stretched to service a larger area without any proportional increase in resources.

Respondents in the Quality of Life Survey rated availability of police and fire services as below:

	Police Services	Fire Services
Informal, low service housing area	61%	53%
Formal, medium service housing area	46%	29%
Formal, high service (high income) housing area	93%	90%

### 5:4:6:3 Public Attitudes

With crime being such a huge concern in the area, perceptions of personal safety are an important feature. The following table from the Quality of Life Survey gives an indication of perceptions of personal safety. Note the big difference between the responses to day and night.

	Day	Night
Formal African	87%	24%
Formal Coloured	83%	31%
Formal White	96%	46%
Formal Asian	91%	52%
Traditional African	97%	43%
Informal African	61%	17%

The response which particularly stands out is that of the Informal African group, where during the day only 61% feel safe, dropping to 17% at night.

When looking at actual crime, 30% of respondents said they were victims of crime against property, while 14% suffered violent crime, 17% of males and 12% of females.

#### **5:4:7 TELECOMMUNICATIONS**

Telecommunications is not a municipal responsibility. However, the extent to which people from different areas in the Buffalo City municipal area have access to public telephones and easy access to post offices, is captured in the following table from the Quality of Life Survey:

	Public phone	Post office
Informal, low service housing area	34%	35%
Formal, medium service housing area	55%	29%
Formal, high service (high income) housing area	94%	87%

Of those who were interviewed almost all said that they had access to a public telephone. Just over half of the respondents said that this service was available to them any time of the day. When asked whether the phones were in good order and well maintained, about half said that they were while the other half said that phones were often vandalised. When asked about new telephone services in the neighbourhood in the last five years, most respondents indicated that this was the case, although in a few cases, respondents said they had not seen any new telephone services being delivered.

#### **5:4:8 EDUCATION**

##### **5:4:8:1 Background**

Responsibility for education and training does not rest with the municipality, and is divided between the national and provincial DoEs, the DOL, state-funded but autonomous institutions and private providers, including NGOs. According to the IDP in the whole of Buffalo City there are an estimated 336 primary and secondary schools, of which 70% are in urban and 30% in rural areas. There are also two university satellite campuses, one in the EL area and one in Bisho; two technikons, both in EL; a technical college, three private colleges and a teachers' centre, all in EL.

It should be noted that with educational statistics quoted the unit is not the whole of Buffalo City, but rather the East London Education District, which includes East London, Mdantsane and neighbouring Great Kei Municipality, but not King William's Town and Zwelitsha. Typically of urban areas, a smaller proportion of the population is of school-going age than in rural areas. Still, 25% (151,550 in total) of the population is of school-going age. There are many indicators that could be quoted, but the tendency is for East London to be in a more favourable position than the rural areas of the Eastern Cape. For example, in 2001 the Learner Educator ratio in East London District was 29:1, as compared to 43:1 in Bizana, 41:1 in Lusikisiki and 28:1 in Port Elizabeth. 66% of East London District schools have electricity, 82% have on-site water; 10% have no toilets; 2% have no direct road access; 93% have landline or cell telephones, as compared, for example, with the equivalent 32%, 24%, 40%, 34%, 76% in Idutywa.

However, comparisons such as these mask the fact that there are many schools in Buffalo City that have many problems.

#### **5:4:8:2 Current Situation**

- In terms of broad issues pertaining to education, though there has been much publicity about corruption, this has in fact tended to be fairly small-scale. More worrying are systemic administrative and governance failures at provincial level that impact on EL as on the whole province.
- In spite of efforts to remedy this, in no area more than education are the effects of inherited South African race and class divisions more evident. What is more, they are recreating themselves in the new context where, while racial divisions still persist, they are being subsumed in a modified class structure where the middle-class is being reconstituted on a non-racial basis. Certainly, large resources have been poured into infrastructural development in the city, but if anything the division between those with reasonable and poor provision has widened. The black middle-class, including township teachers, has tended to migrate to once-white suburbs, and they and even the black upper working-class have tended to remove their children from township schools. The model C schools thus flourish, barely modified in terms of their nearly all-white teaching staff and ethos, and schools in Mdantsane and elsewhere are increasingly ghettoised. These tendencies of course are not

peculiar to East London, but they are particularly stark there, where there are substantial amounts of “old” money, combined with considerable poverty. The model C schools are, therefore, well-financed, and, in terms of teaching skills, books, examination results, extra-curricular activities and many other aspects, effective.

- Schools in Mdantsane and other still black areas, however, with exceptions, tend to be dirty and neglected. While children from better-off backgrounds enter model C schools, families from impoverished rural areas move to often transient urban or peri-urban squatter areas and swell educational demand. The centre of gravity of what is in effect still “black” education has shifted down the social scale, with harmful effects on the education provided. Though there are schools that excel in some areas, in the words of one East London educational consultant, “institutions that stand out as rounded institutions” are not to be found in black areas.
- East London Technical College was a high-quality, successful institution, which was merged with a number of moribund institutions. Though the success of this merger cannot yet be judged, it would appear that the core institution continues to flourish and will hopefully be the basis for an effective wider body. It receives considerable support from industry.
- With encouraging exceptions such as the DFID-supported partnership between SANLI and UNISA, which operates in Buffalo City, ABET has recorded no spectacular successes. Though funding has increased somewhat, quality is still, on the whole, very low.

### **5:4:8:3 Public Attitudes**

From the twelve interviews done, eight of the twelve were satisfied with the general educational situation in their neighbourhoods, one felt it was not so satisfactory, two that it was unsatisfactory and one that it was very unsatisfactory. They were also asked about the existence of education facilities within a half hour walk from homes. Their responses are tabled below:

	Yes	No	Don't know
Creche or child care	12	0	0
Primary school	10	2	0
High school	10	2	0
Adult education centre	5	6	1
Public library	3	9	0

On the positive side, all interviewees had crèche or child care facilities in their neighbourhoods. Most respondents also had Primary and High schools in their neighbourhoods. Only five had an adult education centre nearby, while public libraries were only available in three of the respondents' neighbourhoods.

When asked about the upgrade and building of new schools in their communities in the past five years, two respondents said that new schools have been built while six knew about upgrades of schools.

The overall feeling about adult and child education can be captured in the table below.

	Improved	Stayed the same (all right)	Stayed the same (no good)	Got worse	Don't know
Adult	3	0	3	1	5
Child	3	3	3	1	2

Almost half the respondents do not know whether adult education has improved or become worse. This reflects in part on the few adult education centres available. Only half of the responses to the education of children were positive.

The possible role of the municipality within education should be considered. In many countries school boards or local education authorities run the bulk of the schooling system. Even in South Africa, Nelson Mandela Metro (Port Elizabeth), for example, has invested in this area through such initiatives as provision of educational buildings and sanitation, though strictly speaking this is outside their remit.

## **5:4:9 WASTE MANAGEMENT**

### **5:4:9:1 Background**

The IDP sets out certain objectives in respect of waste management for the five years ahead. These are, to plan comprehensively in the long-term for waste planning, to make waste collection and treatment more efficient, effective and appropriate, to make available landfill sites and transfer stations which comply with national and local legislation, and to reduce the landfill waste by 35% by volume within 5 years through the implementation of waste reduction, re-use and recycling programmes and alternative treatment of waste. Several strategies have been adopted to achieve these objectives. These strategies are, the formulation, adoption and implementation of an Integrated Waste Management Plan (IWMP), investigation of alternative uses and treatment of waste, educational and awareness programmes, partnerships with external organizations, communities and industries, and reviewing applicable by-laws.

### **5:4:9:2 Current Situation**

- Waste streams are divided into various categories namely, domestic, garden, commercial, industrial, and hazardous waste (which includes medical waste).
- Residents of East London and Mdantsane have weekly collection of refuse bags for domestic waste. In East London, garden waste transfer facilities are provided at a number of locations where residents can take their own waste. If placed in bags, it is also collected as part of domestic collections. There are however no transfer facilities available in Mdantsane, so residents either place garden waste bags out for collection with domestic waste or it gets dumped illegally.
- Commercial and industrial waste for businesses in Mdantsane is collected as part of the normal domestic collection operation. In East London, businesses generally make application for a certain number and type of waste containers as well as for the collection frequency required.

- A large new facility is being developed for waste disposal. However, the collection of hazardous waste, of which medical waste forms part, is not a legal requirement and thus the municipality does not have the equipment nor the disposal or treatment facilities to deal with it. In some cases the municipality does, in co-operation with specific industrial entities, collect hazardous waste from industries. The collection of animal carcasses is dealt with by the cleansing department. If members of the public wish to dispose of a carcass, they may take it to the disposal site, where they then also pay a disposal fee. Medical waste is either incinerated at the hospitals or it is collected by specialist contractors and incinerated at private facilities outside the municipality.
- Depending on the type and frequency of service, different refuse removal tariffs are charged. The monthly rate for removal and disposal of domestic refuse for the year 2002/2003 is R49.90. This charge includes the supply of refuse bags.
- A long list of prospective and current projects/programmes is contained in the Integrated Waste Management Plan. Some of these include review of the tariff system, reviews of legislation, public awareness, infrastructural development and the rehabilitation of existing landfill and waste sites.

#### **5:4:9:3 Public attitudes**

- The Quality of Life Survey found that just over 70% of all people in Buffalo City have their rubbish removed weekly by the local authority. The second most common way of disposing of waste is by burning it in a pit; this kind of refuse disposal is used by approximately 24% of the population.
- Differences in waste removal services appear when the type of home and type of service area is taken into account. All of those in formal homes and who live in high service areas have access to refuse removal services. For those in formal homes in medium service areas, the amount drops to only 22%. The corresponding figures for those in informal homes in medium and low service areas are 98% and 53% respectively. Only 3% of those in traditional homes in low service areas have access to refuse removal systems.



- From the twelve interviews that were done, a positive picture emerged. Eleven of the twelve respondents said that the situation in their neighborhoods with regard to refuse collection was satisfactory and that rubbish was regularly removed. Only one person said that it was fairly satisfactory. Eight of the respondents said that it is the municipality who removes the rubbish, three said it was privately removed. One was unsure. When asked about whether the situation for litter and rubbish has been improving or getting worse in the past five years, six responded by saying it was getting better, five said that there has been no change but also then added that they were happy with the situation. One person said that it was getting worse.

### **5:5 Impact: an assessment**

Clearly it is impossible to give a single answer to the question of how the citizens of Buffalo City perceive they are being served in terms of the numerous services which they require and which in one way or another they pay for. This depends on who they are and what their expectations may be, and what their personal experiences may have been in relation to the provision of services. However, Buffalo City wisely commissioned the *Quality of Life Survey*, the results of which appeared in late 2001. An accessible popular version was published in 2002. Durban is the only other South African city so far to have produced such a survey.

Though it also deals with areas of life such as leisure preferences and disposal of personal income that do not fall within government's remit, the *Quality of Life Survey* is crucial for an appreciation of what Buffalo City citizens think about governmental delivery at different levels. It should be referred to directly for a mass of such information. Some figures from the survey, reproduced below, give an excellent picture of the impact of various governmental or semi-governmental services as seen by different categories of citizen, defined by the type of housing in which they live. First, some details about provision will be given; then details about levels of satisfaction. This gives a vivid picture of the objective and subjective dimensions of service delivery.

This chart shows what community services are available to Buffalo City citizens living in three broad types of housing. Note that though minibuses are provided privately, they do have a considerable impact on quality of life for the poor, and have therefore been included.

	Informal, low-service housing	Formal, medium-service housing	Formal, high-service, high-income housing
Public telephones	34%	55%	94%
Easy access to post office	35%	29%	87%
Police services	61%	46%	93%
Clinics	60%	52%	84%
Fire services	53%	29%	90%
Access to new low-cost housing	8%	14%	18%
Street lighting	16%	22%	99%
Storm water drains	10%	15%	97%
Parks and recreational spaces	2%	8%	65%
Minibus taxis	91%	94%	88%
Crèches	65%	74%	82%
Pension payout points	61%	65%	32%

In the population as a whole, nine out of ten people have access to:

- Minibus taxis
- A water supply
- Public schools

At least two-thirds of people have access to:

- Crèches
- A reasonable electricity supply
- Clinics
- Reasonable sanitation
- A refuse removal service
- Roads where traffic moves well
- Postal delivery

- Public telephones
- Police and ambulance services
- Reasonable road surfaces

Over half of people have access to:

- Pension payout points
- A community hall
- A hospital
- Street lighting
- A post office
- Fire services
- Safety for pedestrians

Less than half of people have access to:

- Storm water drains
- Good road signposting
- Libraries, sports facilities, parks and open spaces
- Good pavements
- Bus and train transport
- New high and low cost housing

In terms of satisfaction with some services by those within different categories who have access to them, the figures for the top six categories in each case, divided as above according to people in different housing types, are as follows:

	Informal, low-service housing	Formal, medium-service housing	Formal, high-service, high-income housing
Train services	83%		
Electricity supply	73%	83%	93%
Public telephones	67%		
Pedestrian safety	18%		
Road surfaces	18%	12%	
Storm water drains	16%		
Post office		87%	
Bus transport		84%	55%
Fire department		38%	
Sanitation		33%	
Water supply			92%
Postal deliveries			92%
New low cost housing			33%
Pension payout points			33%

When asked which existing community services they would most like to see improved, health services, roads and street lighting were the services people in general wanted upgraded. Where services were already good, better pavements, more public telephones, better street lighting and better parks were the priorities. People in formal areas with medium service levels and in traditional housing areas wanted better education facilities and roads. Residents in informal areas wanted roads, police stations and health services upgraded.

When asked about community services that they do not now have, but would like to have, 25% overall said that health services were the most important to them. This was particularly true of people in traditional housing areas. For about 10% of people, better road surfaces, community halls and street lighting were the most important. Better recreational facilities are a priority for people in areas where most services are good now. They would particularly like parks and libraries.

This is how the citizens of Buffalo City, at different socio-economic levels, see the services that they have and that they perceive that they need. There are of course other levels of governmental intervention, such as some of those indicated in chapter 3 above, which are not reflected in a study such as the *Quality of Life Survey*, yet may have a considerable influence on the texture of the life

of citizens. Nevertheless, these responses do represent the reactions of the mass of citizens, and should be considered with care.

## 6. SUMMARY AND CONCLUDING REMARKS

Of the eight areas identified for study, Buffalo City is probably the most diffuse. At its core is East London, a comprehensive medium-sized city, with the full range of social environments that any city will have. In addition, since the creation of the municipality of Buffalo City, the metropolitan area now also contains generally impoverished rural areas that are in the metropolitan area, but are certainly not urban. While the focus of this report has tended to be on the urban and township dimension of Buffalo City, it has not always been possible to disaggregate this from the wider entity, and indeed, if the logic of the creation of Buffalo City is followed, it is not necessarily desirable to do so.

How can the question of the impact of governmental action at various levels in this area be summarized? Buffalo City, a new and still largely unproven entity, has inherited a diversity of people and environments, from established urban residential and industrial centres to rural and township parts of an ex-homeland. Being the metropole for the populous and impoverished mainly rural eastern part of the Eastern Cape, its prosperity or otherwise has implications beyond the boundaries of the municipality. It is part of a politically sensitive area with a long history of political activism.

In terms of the impact of official action on the area, this report has been structured around the two poles of what could be called special interventions, and the normal course of service delivery at local government level. In tracking the course of special interventions, the inevitable and abiding tension between welfare and development was noted. Certainly, even those interventions that predominantly emphasise welfare do so in the context of an expressed commitment to economic growth, but the main contribution that they in fact make in those terms tends to be the creation of temporary jobs while improving the physical infrastructure of the area concerned. These are likely to be limited in terms of the elusive goal of sustainable economic growth. Indeed, even beneficial impacts in social terms are sometimes vitiated by inefficiency and accusations of partiality.

On the other hand, projects that seek directly to address economic development have to be seen against the prevailing economic and social realities. In what is now the Buffalo City area, homeland economic development took place against the background of the protectionist economic policies of the time, with subsidies the order of the day. The new government, in tune with the increasingly globalised economy from which there was no escape, except perhaps into stagnation,

shifted to a quite different policy wherein private capital, South African or international, was encouraged to locate in a city the benefits of which were defined in terms of competitive access to the world and South African markets. Rather than pouring money into deprived areas with impoverished populations, the concept now became to make use of existing infrastructure. Therefore, East London itself, with its port, airport and other facilities, is put forward as the rational business destination, and the hoped-for jobs will be in the city and not, as with the homeland development policy, in centres in the rural areas. Though these policies have been mooted for some years, in Buffalo City they are only now beginning to come to fruition, and their impact has yet to be seen.

These special projects, however, should be seen against the background of the day-to-day functioning of local government, which is the main, though not the only, delivery agent for services to the population. A fundamental question facing Buffalo City is that of increasing equity while sufficiently maintaining the physical and organisational structures and services of the urban core. In concrete terms in the case under review, the balance between the needs of East London proper, and Mdantsane, and the balance between the broader urban sector and the rural areas that are now part of the municipality, encapsulate this dilemma. How has this potential tension been handled? How have the various actors responded to this challenge?

On one level, the old city of East London brought with it the technical and administrative structures characteristic of that time. Services were organised for a relatively small city predominantly in the interests of the white, middle-class population. The great bulk of the urban population, which lived in Mdantsane, were in terms of the politics of the time not even living in the same country, and the facilities available to them were of a very low standard. Those that lived within the city boundaries, such as the inhabitants of Duncan Village, were neglected.

It is not, however, simply a question of spreading more thinly the material and human resources that had previously been devoted to the “old” East London. The period since 1994 has been dynamic and rapidly-changing, and though the overall context is positive, in some ways this fluidity has not redounded to the benefit of the enlarged city. There has been, in some cases, an absolute loss of the skilled persons who are essential to the planning and maintenance of the services upon which the city relies. Neither is it a simple question of deciding to develop previously underprivileged areas at the expense of the more prosperous areas, since industrial development, for instance – including the development that is hoped for from the ELIDZ - relies on the provision of resources both to

industry itself, and to the middle-class areas where the managers and skilled workers in these new or expanded industries would live. Since it is believed that new industry will benefit the population as a whole, it can be seen that the maintenance of reasonable middle-class standards in the wealthier parts of the city is relevant to the interests of the mass of the population.

Considerable progress has been made in a number of spheres in the provision of services. In some cases this has been held up by structures appropriate for the earlier context that could not easily adapt to the new situation. However, it should be noted that a situation where technical problems may be underestimated in the context of the understandable demand for services, and where often shrinking numbers of technically skilled individuals are responsible for a greatly expanded area and many more people, is not always conducive to imaginative solutions. There is a mostly ageing corps of technical professionals, and replacing them is difficult. There is in fact a crisis of capacity which, unless there is a significant change, is likely to intensify. For reasons to do with salary levels, the relative isolation of Buffalo City from the main South African centres, the changing balance between the public and private sectors, and the fluidity consequent on repeated organisational restructuring, there is a real problem in maintaining staffing at the higher technical levels in Buffalo City. Electrical, water, sanitation and other services cannot be run without such expertise.

Mutual understanding is needed of what is demanded on the one hand, and what is technically and financially possible on the other, between administrators and technical experts, and political and community leaders. People in East London are struggling with real and immediate problems. They lack basic services and necessities as well as the ability and opportunity to support and sustain themselves and their families. If an indication of what people want and need can be taken from the *Quality of Life Survey* and from our twelve interviewees, then what people want would be jobs, houses, water, electricity, clinics, proper roads, and so we can continue. All these are necessities for very basic living. Imagination and creativity will help greatly to provide such things. However, resources, but even more the administrative and technical capability to utilise these resources are also crucial. Unlike some rural areas, Buffalo City is fortunate in having the core competencies to enable development and the maintenance of a decent life. Inevitably, in the pursuit of justice for all, there has been some disruption of these frameworks, but they are still present and functioning. If there is one lesson to be drawn from this research at the crucial local level of service delivery, it is that the consolidation and strengthening of administrative and technical capacity in all spheres on



the new basis must be the priority. With the creation of Buffalo City, the period of flux and uncertainty should now be over.

## **Some Documents Consulted**

Buffalo City Municipality, 2001. Funding Proposal for Urban Renewal Objectives in the Township of Mdantsane. 8 October 2001.

Buffalo City Municipality, 2002. Integrated Development Plan 2002.

Buffalo City, 2003. Restructuring Grant Application.

Buffalo City Municipality, 2003. 2002/03 Operating Capital Budget Report.

Buffalo City Municipality, 2003. Integrated Waste Management Plan.

Buffalo City Quality of Life/ Needs Assessment Survey Report, 2001. Commissioned by Swedish International Development Agency (Sida) and produced by ISER and DRA Development CC. November 2001.

Eastern Cape Department of Education, 2002. Review of Education Indicators 1995-2001.

Morrow, B., 2002. Life in Buffalo City. Robin Richards Ed. Institute of Social and Economic Research. Rhodes University, Buffalo City (East London).

Richards, R. and Kamman, E., 2001. Monitoring Poverty and Inequality in Buffalo City. Institute of Social and Economic Research (ISER), Rhodes University, East London.

Strategic Planning Workshop Document, 2002. East London Industrial Development Zone. 02-03 December 2003, Haga-haga Hotel.

Many additional documents, pamphlets, web-sites and other material was also consulted.

## **Interviewees During Field-work**

### **Interviewees**

Mr Peter King	- Acting City Manager and Director: Social Services
Mr Brian Shepherd	- Chief Financial Officer
Mr Hamish Forest	- Director: Engineering Services
Mr Craig Sam	- Director: Planning and Economic Development
Mr Doug James	- General Manager: Water, Wastewater and Scientific Services
Ms Phila Xuza	- General Manager: Local Economic Development and Tourism
Mr Harden Beck	- General Manager: Electrical and Mechanical Services
Mr Steve Terwin	- General Manager: Public Safety
Dr M. Nkohla	- General Manager: Health Services
Mrs Mabece	- Head: Nursing Services
Mr Tabele	- Head: Environmental Health Services
Mr Devan Govender	- General Manager: Housing
Mr Shaun Peard	- General Manager: Roads and Design
Mr Peter Rankin	- Economic Advisor to BC Municipality
Mr Tom Wanklin	- Tshani Consulting c.c.
Mr Peter Myles	- CEO, East London Industrial Development Zone
Mr Stuart Bartlett	- Regional Manager, Industrial Development Corporation
Mr Glen Hollands	- Afesis-corplan (development NGO)
Mr Fred Kusambiza-Kiingi	- Afesis-corplan (development NGO)
Mr Jonathan Goddard	- Educational consultant
Mr Patrick Lemmens	- Manager, Housing Association East London
Mr Andrew Murray	- Eastern Cape Socio-Economic Consultative Council
Mr Leslie Bank	- Institute of Social and Economic Research, Rhodes University
Ms Ellen Kamman	- Institute of Social and Economic Research, Rhodes University
Ms Vanessa Kruger	- Consultant on governance and administration
Mr Ian Weir	- Consultant on governance and administration

### **Interviewers, Citizen Interviews**

Mr. Brown Maaba  
Ms Bulelwa Metuse

### **Backchecking Interviews**

Mr Khanyiso Sangotsha